



GOVERNMENT OF JAMMU & KASHMIR

Chief Minister's Monitoring Cell

www.jkcmmonitoring.nic.in

**Physical verification report of the project namely
"CONSTRUCTION OF 200 BEDDED MATERNITY HOSPITAL"
District Jammu**



By
Deputy Director,
CM's Monitoring Cell.

Name of Project : Const. of 200 Bedded Maternity Hospital, Jammu
 Implementing Agency : Principal, Government Medical College, Jammu
 Executing Agency : Chief Engineer, Public Works (R&B), Jammu
 Funding Agency : Ministry of Health, Govt. of India.
 Year of Start : 2012-13
 Year of Completion : 2014-15 (3 years: targeted)

Financial Progress:-

(Rs in Crore)

Approved Cost	50.00
Funds Released	5.00
Value of work done	i) 0.28 (by J&K Housing Board) ii) R&B is yet to assess the value of work done by it
Expenditure Incurred upto Jan 2013	0.00

Physical Progress:-

SNo	Items	Physical Progress
1	Main Hospital Building with civil, electrical & plumbing works	Work stands allotted. Site has been cleared by dismantling an old ANMT school building and removing its debris. Earth excavation work for laying the foundation is in progress
2	Procurement & installation of 4 number lifts	---
3	Fire fighting system with fire alarm system	---
4	HVAC system 300 TR	---
5	Procurement & installation of 2 no. 630 KVA capacity electric transformers with HT/ LT line.	---
6	Procurement & installation of 2 no. 320 KVA capacity DG sets of approved make	---
7	Procurement & installation of 2 no. 630 KVA capacity Voltage Stabilizers with HT/LT onels	---
8	Central sterilisation system	---
9	Design, supply & installation of incinerator	---
10	Medical gases supply system	---
11	Hospital furniture	---

Need of Project:-

Out of every 1000 live births, 44 infants die in our country even today. About 56,000 women have died during 2010 in the process of giving birth to child. Due to such alarming rates of infant and maternal mortality, the Government at the Centre as well as in the states have initiated massive campaign through media, besides engaging ASHA workers, to persuade people to avail medical facilities during child birth and neo-natal care through the network of government hospitals and shun the practise of child birth in homes. Apart from creating better medical facilities in hospitals the government offers incentives to mothers for undergoing institutional deliveries. Taking another step in its initiatives, the Government of India has recently agreed to provide funds to J&K state for setting up two new 200 bedded maternity hospitals, one each in the cities of Jammu and Srinagar.

Moreover, the need has been felt for setting up another maternity hospital at Jammu because the main maternity hospital housed in SMGS Hospital Complex, Jammu always remains overcrowded.

Field Observations:-

The new 200 bedded Maternity Hospital at Jammu is being constructed on a piece of land measuring 05 kanals & 15 marlas (60 m X 48.5 m) within the premises of the Government Hospital at Gandhi Nagar.

During the field visit conducted on 22-01-2013, it has been observed that the earth excavation work using a JCB machine is in progress at the site. Almost the entire construction area of 03 kanals & 04 marlas (49 m X 33 m) had been excavated up to a depth of about 1.5 to 3 meters. What worried the inspection team was that there is very little space left between the rectangular shaped excavated area and the adjoining buildings on its three sides and the street on the fourth side. The three adjoining building are the OPD & Eye Blocks of Government Hospital Gandhi Nagar, Children's Wards of the Hospital and the new building of Girls Higher Secondary School, Gandhi Nagar. The space between the excavated site and these three buildings and the street is in the range of 6 to 8 meters. The space between the street and the excavated site is not a cause of concern, of course; the existing buildings definitely are and why shouldn't it be; for the State has recently witnessed a portion of rear side wall of its Legislative Assembly building at Jammu collapse when necessary precautions had not been taken by JKPC while excavating land behind the said building. The Executive Engineer of the R&B Construction Division No.1 who was also present at site informed that all the necessary precautions have been taken into account in order to prevent occurrence of any untoward incident at the site. The Engineer might be true based on his technical calculations, but the site seemed dangerous for the adjoining buildings for a lay man, including the inspection team. The engineers and the consultant engaged needs to reaffirm if their calculations are accurate.

The Engineer further informed that a sample of the soil has been taken from the site and sent to the Lab for testing and that the report is awaited. It is again difficult to understand how engineers prepare estimates without a soil testing report. A couple of months back, while inspecting the on-going construction work of ITI Banihal it was found that the cost of the project had been revised (escalated exorbitantly) as the structure design of the building had to be changed from a load bearing one to a RRC one when the soil test was conducted after the estimates were approved and the soil report did not favour the construction of a load bearing structure.

The Executive Engineer also brought to notice that this site had an old double storey ANMT School building which had been dismantled by the J&K Housing Board Corporation. The Housing Board Corporation had been entrusted the task of constructing the Hospital prior to R&B and it had already begun the excavation work when R&B took over. Another interesting aspect noted is that the estimates of the project which have been approved by GoI were prepared by the J&K Projects Construction Corporation. The project seems to have finally landed in to the basket of R&B after a melee among the three contenders viz. JKPC, J&K Housing Board Corporation and the Chief Engineer, R&B, Jammu.

A new septic tank had been constructed at site along the edge of the excavation site facing the OPD Block of Gandhi Nagar Hospital as the old septic tanks catering to the need of the existing Hospital were located on the excavated area and had to be demolished in order to clear the site.

The side of the construction site facing the street has been covered using steel sheets and a gate has also been installed. The problem being faced at this instant of time is that the rubble and earth material that is being excavated has to be removed from site on trucks. The trucks cannot enter the city during day due to which this work is mostly carried out at night.

On enquiring from the Executive Engineer if permission had been obtained from the Jammu Municipal Corporation to take up the massive construction exercise, to this he replied saying that R&B is in the process of moving the relevant papers in the JMC. He has been asked to ensure that the needful is done without any delay for the NOC of JMC is mandatory to carry out construction within the city limits and particularly in the instant case where little open space is left not only around the new Maternity Hospital that shall be ready in the next few years but also around the adjoining Government Hospital.

Problem Areas/ Suggestions:-

1. **Inadequate space:** The 200 bedded maternity hospital is being constructed on a piece of land measuring 05 kanals & 15 marlas. The space available is just inadequate for taking up the construction of a 7-storey structure with build-up area of 03 kanals & 4 marlas. This can be justified on the basis of following arguments: -

a) Comparison with other hospitals: To begin with let's compare the land made availability for the new 200 Maternity Hospital with the other Health Institutions that coming up in the State and have also been inspected by the Monitoring Cell during the last two years: -

PHC Batpora	5 kanals
CHC Basholi (40 bedded)	53 kanals 2 marlas
CHC Khour	12 kanals 10 marlas
CHC Chenani	21 kanals
Sub-District Hospital Kokernag	20 kanals
Sub-District Hospital Yaripora	13 kanals
Sub-District Hospital Tiryath Rajouri	15 kanals
District Hospital Rajouri (200 bedded)	30 kanals
District Hospital Reasi	100 kanals
District Hospital Shopian	14 kanals
District Hospital Ganderbal (200 bedded)	88 kanals
Super Speciality Hospital Jammu	45 kanals

Except for PHC Batpora, construction of none of the remaining hospitals, either within the urban areas or in the rural areas, has been taken up on such a meagre space as this 200 bedded Maternity Hospital. Even the PHC Batpora, which shall be catering to a comparatively lesser population, is better off with 5 kanals of area.

b) Land availability: One may counter-argue that there is a trend of vertical growth in urban centres across the country and the world over. This trend evident in some big cities has been adopted primarily because there is little scope for expansion and the cost of land available is extremely high. This argument doesn't hold good for Jammu city. The price of land of course might be rising, but one cannot negate the fact that the city limits of Jammu are expanding. One can witness new commercial and residential complexes coming up along the Kunjwani-Narwal-Sidhra NH-1A, and along the roads connecting Jammu with Akhnoor, Jammu with Kunjwani via Satwari, Satwari with Miran Sahib, etc. In a city where the rural-urban fringe is volatile there is always

scope for acquisition of land, especially; when it comes to setting-up a vital health institution which shall cater not just the residents of Jammu city but to the entire population of Jammu Division. The eviction drive recently carried out by the Jammu Development Authority in and around Sidhra area by way of demolishing illegal structures which encroachers had raised/ erected on the state land is an indication to the fact that there is no dearth of vacant government land within the municipal limits of Jammu. **Such a piece of state land, on which development activity is yet to be carried out by the government and is a temptation for the encroachers when left unattended, should have been chosen for constructing the Hospital.**

- c) Financial aspect: Coming to the financial side of the project, there are be two basement floors proposed in the building which shall be used as parking space, placing LT/HT panels and shall also comprise store rooms, mortuary, prayer room, etc. It has been informed that the basement floors had to be included basically for using these as parking as there will be hardly any vacant space left around the hospital after the building is ready. However, it is necessary to point out that the space available in the two basement floors will be sufficient to park just 38 light vehicles and a few two wheelers. Not to speak of patients and their attendants, this meagre parking space will hardly suffice the need of even the staff of a tertiary hospital of such a huge magnitude. The cost of construction has been calculated on the basis of construction area of each floor of the building. The cost of construction of the two basement floors roughly in the range of Rs 3 to 4 crore. **In case state land is not available, this amount of Rs 3 to 4 crore can be easily saved by not constructing the basement floors and expended to acquire the minimum required private land (30-40 kanals) so that a five storey hospital having ample parking space (150-200 vehicles) and green areas as well is constructed. When a five storey structure with less cost, less execution time and better parking facilities can serve the purpose why construct a seven storey structure?**
- d) Traffic Congestion: The city lanes around the Gandhi Nagar Hospital Complex are not wide enough even to cater the need of the existing vehicular traffic. One can see number of light vehicles parked along the shops adjacent to the Hospital. With another Hospital of such huge magnitude coming up in vicinity, the traffic movement on these lanes is nothing but going to worsen even further thereby adding to the problems for the traffic police and the administration.

Suggestion: The government needs to take notice of the issue and seriously review the decision of site selection before it is too late. This is necessary for planned development of Jammu city. Moreover, when crores of rupees out of the tax-payers money is being invested for creating a tertiary health infrastructure it needs to be ensured that every penny spent is accounted for.

2. **Clearance to be obtained from JMC:** R&B Department has commenced the work even before obtaining permission from Jammu Municipal Corporation. The JMC too does not seem to be bothered to verify if the work is being carried out by the executing agency as per the municipal building norms.

Suggestion: The executing agency must immediately process the papers and drawings to obtain permission from JMC. Rather than raising observations, if any, at a later stage; the JMC needs to ensure that all the required papers & drawings of the Maternity Hospital Complex are made available to it by the Chief Engineer, R&B, Jammu so that these are examined in time.

3. **Design/Cost of Project:** The design of the Maternity Hospital Building has been prepared by Sanreen Designer Pvt. Ltd. engaged by the JKPC. Approval has been conveyed by GOI to the said design. Later on the project was handed to J&K Housing Board and finally to R&B Department. The R&B Department has in its letter No HD/Plan/MH/Jmu/Sgr/2011 dated 27-07-2012 (copy annexed with the report) conveyed to the Chief Engineer, R&B, Jammu that the setting-up of a new 200 bedded Maternity Hospital has been approved by Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, GoI at a cost of **Rs 50.00 crore** on the basis of DPR formulated by the JKPC and that the Chief Engineer shall formulate the project based on the approved DPRs and get the works allotted/ executed by adopting the process of e-tendering in which JKPC and J&K Housing Board may also participate. Accordingly, the e-tenders were floated in which the government as well as private contractors participated and M/s Kapahi Construction Company which emerged as the lowest bidder was awarded the contract of constructing the building. However, another striking feature to be noted here is that R&B has prepared another estimate which differs from the one prepared by R&B. While comparing the abstract of the estimates prepared by JKPC with those prepared by R&B the following variations have been noted: -

- i. By adding plinth area of **122.68 sqm**, for construction of 2 lift machine rooms, R&B has increased cost of construction of the main building by an amount of **Rs 2.56 crore** and this has in turn has increased the consultancy charges (2%) by an amount of **Rs 5.23 lakh**.
- ii. The provision of funds kept for soil testing has been increased by R&B from **Rs 3.00 lakh** to **Rs 5.00 lakh**.
- iii. The labour cess in the estimate of R&B has got reduced by **Rs 3.71 lakh** due to deduction of Corporation fee which was to be charged by JKPCC.
- iv. In the estimates of R&B an extra amount of **Rs 26.92 lakh** reported to have been expended by the J&K Housing Board for dismantling the old ANMT school building and removing its debris from site.

The variations pointed out are evident from the comparative table drawn below: -

(Rs in lakhs)				
SNo	Item	JKPCC	R&B	Variation
1	Main Hospital Building with civil, electrical & plumbing works	3000.36	3466.45	+256.01
2	Procurement & installation of 4 number lifts	159.84		
3	Fire fighting system with fire alarm system	50.24		
4	HVAC system 300 TR	240.00	240.00	-
5	Procurement & installation of 2 no. 630 KVA capacity electric transformers with HT/ LT line.	30.00	30.00	-
6	Procurement & installation of 2 no. 320 KVA capacity DG sets of approved make	70.00	70.00	-
7	Procurement & installation of 2 no. 630 KVA capacity Voltage Stabilizers with HT/LT onels	30.00	30.00	-
8	Central sterilisation system	140.00	140.00	-
9	Design, supply & installation of incinerator	100.00	100.00	-
10	Medical gases supply system	200.00	200.00	-
11	Hospital furniture	100.00	100.00	-
	Total	4120.44	4381.45	+256.01

12	Soil testing	3.00	5.00	+2.00
13	Consultancy (2%)	82.40	87.63	+5.23
14	Work charge & contingencies (1%)	41.20	0.00	-41.20
15	Corporation's profit	212.35	0.00	-212.35
16	Service tax	293.03	460.05	+167.02
17	Labour cess (1%)	47.52	43.81	-3.71
18	Dismantling of old ANMT building by J&K Housing Board	0.00	26.92	+26.92
	G. Total	4799.94	4999.86	199.92

It can be construed from the above analysis that R&B could have reduced the cost of the project by an amount of Rs 253.55 lakhs (corporation fee + contingency) bringing the total cost down to Rs 4546.39 crore, instead; it has added an amount of Rs 453.47 lakhs escalating the total cost to Rs 4999.86 lakh. **It seems R&B intends to expend the entire amount of Rs 50.00 crore assured for the project by GoI by altering the estimates as per convenience, rather than restricting to the approved design and making judicious use of development funds.**

Suggestion: R&B Department needs to ensure that there is no drift from the design approved by MoH, GoI without seeking a prior nod from the concerned authorities in GoI. R&B Department also need to reply to the following queries which presumably sound logical: -

- i. The total construction area of all the 7 floors in the estimates of JKPC is 11319 sqm (1617 sqm/ floor) but in the estimates of R&B this area is 11441.68 (1617 sqm/floor + 112.68 sqm for 02 lift machine rooms. Provision of lift already exists in the estimates of JKPC. Now, has this additional area of 122.68 sqm which has escalated the cost of project by an amount of Rs 2.56 crore been omitted by the JKPC or has it been added by R&B by changing the design of building?
- ii. What is the reason for a difference of Rs 2.00 lakh in the provision kept for soil testing in the two estimates?
- iii. Increase in construction cost by R&B has led to an increase in consultancy charges by an amount of Rs 5.23 lakh. The consultancy charges have risen from Rs 82.40 lakh to Rs 87.63 lakh. Is this justified?

The Joint Development Commissioner (Works) also needs to be provided copies of both the estimates so that he too can perform a technical check on the estimates and advise the executing agency accordingly.

Physical Verification Conducted by :	Madan Gopal Sharma, Deputy Director Planning, Monitoring Cell, Chief Minister's Secretariat.
Officer of Executing Agency who accompanied the inspecting officer:	Sh. D.K.Rampaul, Xen Sh. Pawan Gupta, AEE Sh. Ashok Khajuria, I/C AE Construction Division-I (R&B) Jammu.
Date of conduct of physical inspection:	22-01-2013



Excavation work in progress along the rear wall of Children's ward of Govt. Hospital Gandhinagar



Steel stalked in front of OPD Block of Govt. Hospital Gandhinagar



Site along the street fenced using steel sheets



Edge of site along new building of Girls Higher Secondary School Gandhinagar



New septic tank constructed for Govt. Hospital Gandhinagar and is small store room to keep cement and other masonry equipment



Main entry to the 200 bedded Hospital is from this congested street where vehicles remain always parked